# Public Participation and EIA process in India

3<sup>rd</sup> and 4<sup>th</sup> November, 2016 Osaka, Japan

Ritwick Dutta Legal Initiative for Forest and Environment India





# Environmental Justice Atlas (EJAtlas.org): India reaches the top while mapping the ecological conflicts and environmental injustices

The Environmental Justice Atlas or EJAtlas.org is a freely accessible on-line interactive information portal that helps academic scholars and public policymakers across the world in identifying exemplary cases of peoples' resistance against climate change and environment degradation. EJAtlas.org is conceived by the EJOLT project - an acronym for the 'Environmental Justice, Liabilities and Trade' project. EJOLT is a European Commission FP7 programme-funded global research project operated during 2011-2015 and concluded recently. It represents a global distribution map of the ecological conflicts, resistances and environmental injustices, which are mostly located in the Global South. The stated purpose of the project is: 'EJOLT is a global research project bringing science and acciety together to

resistances in India, which are located across the country in almost every state and union territory. Table 1 shows the first-level categorization of conflicts in India. Conflicts related to the 'water management' category appear highest





indianexpress.com/article/india/india-news-india/air-pollution-china-india/ C

# The Indian **EXPRESS**

**O** 

Home > India > India - News-India > Half of world's air pollution deaths occur in China, India

[]]

# Half of world's air pollution deaths occur in China, India

More than 5.5 million people die prematurely each year due to air pollution with over half of those dea and India



-



HDFC<sup>™</sup> Home Loan @9.40%\* Attractive Interest Rate With EMI of just Rs 834\* Per Lakh.Apply Now! home-loans.hdfc.com/EMI\_Calculator

8+

in

P

Personal loan in 2 Min Sal> 30K. Interest Rate at 11.49%. Loans from 50K to 20L. Apply Now! www.indialends.com

Ads by Google

ASHINGTON: More than 5.5 million people worldwide die prematurely every year due to household and outdoor air pollution, and India and China together account for 55% of these



Budget 2016 | Railway Budge

Follow / Like us at @timesofindia





Here goes the entire list of 20 most polluted cities of the World:





-

**O** 

0



National Green Tribunal's direction on Public participation

### Public Consultation, 2006

# EIA Process in India

Statutory Appeal before National Green Tribunal

Decision to Grant or Reject Environmental Clearance (Environmental Clearance)

**Public Consultation** 

(Public Hearing & Written Representations)

Screening, Scoping (Terms of Reference for EIA Report)

# The Public Participation under the 2006, Notification

"Public Consultation" refers to the process by which the **concerns** of **local affected persons** and <u>others</u> who have a <u>plausible stake</u> in the <u>environmental impacts</u> of the project or activity are ascertained with a view to taking into account all the material concerns in the project or activity design as appropriate"



Samarth Trust *Versus* Ministry of Environment and Forest Delhi High Court

.....it seems, prima facie, that so far as a public hearing is concerned, its scope is limited and confined to those locally affected persons residing in the close proximity of the project site. *However*, in our opinion, the (EIA) Notification does not preclude or prohibit persons not living in the close proximity of the project site from participating in the public hearing - they too are permitted to participate and express their views for or against the project.

"40. ... We therefore hold that in the context of the EIA Notification dated 14th September 2006 and the mandatory requirement of holding public hearings to invite objections it is the duty of the EAC, to whom the task of evaluating such objections has been delegated, to indicate in its decision the fact that such objections, and the response thereto of the project proponent, were considered and the reasons why any or all of such objections were accepted or negatived. The failure to give such reasons would render the decision vulnerable to attack on the ground of being vitiated due to non-application of mind to relevant materials and therefore arbitrary."

Delhi High Court's decision in Utkarsh Mandal v. Union of India & Ors.

# Issues with Respect to Public Participation

### Public Participation is EIA Centric

Significant categories of project do not require public consultation

### Projects circumvent Public consultation

Environmental laws do not provide for much scope for public consultation.

# Disputes around communication



# Disputes around 'minutes of the public hearing'



#### **Venue of Public Hearing**

"A Public Hearing is one of the components of Public consultation and is the process by which concerns of local affected persons who are likely to suffer due to the environmental impact of project or activity, are ascertained. Naturally, therefore it is expected to hold a public Hearing at or in close proximity to the project site in order to ensure and facilitate wide participation of the Public particularly those who are likely to be affected by the project, being in close proximity."







India has been limiting leases, mainly because of protests over land acquisition. (AP)

#### RELATED

Bhullar docs say not consulted The Supreme Court on Thursday ruled that the Vedanta Group's bauxite mining project in the Niyamgiri Hills of Orissa will have to get clearance from the gram sabha, which will consider the cultural and religious rights of the tribals and forest dwallers living in

#### BATTLE FOR NIYAMGIRI

## Results of India's first environment referendum: 12 nays; 0 ayes

Will Vedanta and Odisha government pursue rights to mine the hills revered by the Dongria Kondhs in the Supreme Court?

# VEDANTA

# POSCO

# LAFARGE

# ADANI

# Indian Environmental Court **"THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL"**



# **Aggrieved Person Interpreted:**

Save Mon Region Federation vs Union of India

National Green Tribunal

• "Law gives a right to 'any person' who is 'aggrieved' by an order to prefer an appeal. The term 'any person' has to be widely construed. It is to include all legal entities so as to enable them to prefer an appeal, even if such an entity does not have any direct or indirect interest in a given project. The expression 'aggrieved', again, has to be construed liberally. The framers of law intended to give the right to any person aggrieved, to prefer an appeal without any limitation as regards his locus or interest. The grievance of a person against the Environmental Clearance may be general and not necessarily person specific"









### National Green Tribunal stalls POSCO - Centre for Science ...

#### www.cseindia.org > Industry & Environment > Community Support -

In a stirring judgement passed by the **National Green Tribunal (NGT**), the green signal given to South Korea's Pohang Iron and Steel Company (**POSCO**) to ...

### National Green Tribunal suspends Posco project - India Today

#### indiatoday.intoday.in > Business > India 💌

Mar 31, 2012 - The **National Green Tribunal** has suspended the **Posco** project in Odisha over ... "I have to go into it (**order**) in detail and study the judgment and ...



HomeNewsMarketsCompaniesEconomyInfo-techOpinionSpecialsLuxeNationalScienceSolutions & CoSportsWorldVarietyEducationReal Estate

#### Unable to execute project in Odisha: POSCO tells NGT

PRESS TRUST OF INDIA

COMMENT  $\cdot$  PRINT  $\cdot$  T+

## Project in Odisha is over, says Posco

Says current extension of environmental clearance too short for completion and it wishes to end the entire idea

NITIN SETHI | New Delhi April 9, 2016 Last Updated at 00:46 IST





# Save Mon Region Federation

Local Buddhist Federation challenges the 780 MW Hydro Power Project

(2012)

EIA Report did not mention about the presence of the Black Necked Crane

Statutory Appeal filed before the NGT (2012)

Final Judgment of the NGT (2016)

NGT heard the case over a period of two years



DUGH AGAINST ANTI-INDIA ACTS, E OLD RAIL ROUTES | 4

# hars tower over fields Structures Herald Arrival Of Harvest Festival

TIMES CITY

(Clock wise from left)

cultural significance. Encased in rustic design that is simple but robust, a

bhela ghar can accommodate a couple of people who opt to

spend the uruka night inside

Bhela ghars are build mostly in the open space, a dried paddy field provides a safe option as it is burnt in full spirit on Bihu.

TURNOUT OVER 65% | 4

CIVIC POLLS PEACEFUL IN FOUR MANIPUR DISTRICTS,

did not take him much time

to realize that the graceful

birds had much more to them

than the religious significan-

as an embodiment of the

hailing from Tawang.

CE.

Meji, on the other hand, is mostly made from wood, bamboo, straw, hay and with dried banana leaves, heaped on the fields.

Some communities believe that a Meji is a representation of the funeral pyre of the godfather of the Panadavas and Kauravas from the Ma-

habharata. The custom is, after taking a bath people crowd around the meji and lit it with a bamboo flame. They pay their obeisance and seek blessings from the holy pyre. They then offer peetha, lentils, sesame, and sweets, to the holy fire.

The Rajbongshis, Rabhas and Dimasas believe that a burning meji is a representation of the funeral pyre of

Paying obeisance on Bihu Rhishma. is an important part of Bihu, said Upen Rabha Hakcham. academician, associated with Gauhati University.

#### stake claim to hydro project site Naresh Mitra 3 times group.com Guwahati: When Lham Tsering photographed two black-necked cranes in December last year, in the Zemithang area of Arunachal Pradesh's Tawang district, it

Times of India, 12 Jan 16

Zemithang, is one such site where black-necked cranes take shelter during winter. It is also a proposed project si-The Buddhist Monpa trite. The birds started arriving be in the state welcome the arrival of the black-necked in the stretch from mid-Decrane as messenger of good cember last year. fortune. They revere the bird

Rare cranes arrive in Tawang,

"Villagers and members of our organization have sighted and even photograpsixth Dalai Lama (Gyalwa hed black-necked cranes this Tsangyang Gyatso), a Monpa winter. The arrival of the However, for the Buddcranes in the place, where the hydropower project is hist lamas who are opposing proposed, proves beyond dothe proposed 780-MW Nyamubt that the area is a winter jang Chhu hydroelectric prorefuge for the birds. These ject, the arrival of blackbirds have immense cultunecked cranes this season is ral, religious and ecological an incontrovertible evidensignificance for our people," ce that the site, where the Buddhist lama and Save Mon dam has been proposed, is a Region Federation (SMRF) place where the birds winter. general secretary Lobsang A short 3-km stretch along the Nyamjang Chhu, Gyatso said. between Brokenthang and

The Buddhist Monpa tribe in the state welcome the arrival of the black-necked cranes as messengers of good fortune. They revere the bird as an embodiment of the sixth Dalai Lama

The Bombay Natural History Society (BNBS) has identified the stretch as an Important Bird Area (IBA). Villagers have, for the last eight years, been documenting the birds on the stretch. The globally-threatened species is included in the Schedule I of the Wildlife (Protection) Act, 1972.

The Buddhist lamas, under SMRF banner, had filed a case before the National Green Tribunal in 2012 against the environmental clearance given to the project. One of SMRF's contentions was that the project developers allegedly did not disclose during environmental clearance that the site was actually the winter habitat of the blacknecked cranes.



As men devote time in building bhela ghars, the women put their best gastronomical skills to test, focusing on the community feast for uruka night and the main gourmet

meal on Bihu.



Home Today's Paper All Sections News National International Opinion Business Sport Vi

» TODAY'S PAPER » NATIONAL

NEW DELHI, April 22, 2016

#### Bird hit: NGT halts Tawang hydro power project



Green tribunal steps in to save the future of the vulnerable black-necked crane



In bird heaven: The black-necked crane is listed in the Wildlife Act as a Schedule 1 species.— Photo: special arrangement

The threat to the future of a vulnerable l species has halted the Rs. 6,400-crore h power project in Tawang, Arunachal Prac

The National Green Tribunal (NGT) has suspended the Union Environment Minis clearance for the project granted in 2012. 1 clearance, the court noted, didn't consider impact of the hydro project — promoted by Noida-based textile-to-steel conglomerate, Bhilwara Group — on the habitat of the blac necked crane, a species that breeds on the Tibetan plateau and migrates to Tawang for winter. The bird, most commonly found in Cl is legally protected in Bhutan and India and is considered sacred to certain Buddhist traditio



### **Directions in Save Mon region Federation**

The MoEF&CC shall cause to be made a separate study of E-flow requirement for protection of habitat of the Black necked Crane and for conservation of the Black necked Crane through the Wildlife Institute of India, Dehradun, as expeditiously as possible and make such study report along with Tawang River Basin study available for 'public consultation' and shall hold 'public consultation' in compliance of the aforesaid direction in accordance with law.



Home > India > India > India News > Arunachal anti-dam protests: Buddhist 'monk' among two killed in Tawang police firing

# Arunachal anti-dam protests: Buddhist 'monk' among two killed in Tawang police firing

While prohibitory orders under Section 144 were prom flag march, sources said.



#### BEFORE THE NATIONAL GREEN TRIBUNAL PRINCIPAL BENCH NEW DELHI

.....

#### APPEAL NO. 28 OF 2013

#### In the matter of :

#### Paryawaran Sanrakshan Sangarsh Samiti Lippa

Village & Post - Lippa Tehsil Moorang District - Kinnaur Himachal Pradesh – 172109

Verses

#### 1. Union of India

Through the Secretary, Ministry of Environment and Forests, Paryavaran Bhavan, CGO Complex, Lodi Road, New Dehi- 1100003, (i) The Respondents No.1 and 2 shall ensure that the entire proposal pertaining to Forest Clearance in respect of Stages II and III of 130 MW Kashang Integrated Hydro Electric Project is placed before the Gram Sabha of

18

villages Lippa, Rarang, Pangi and Telangi in Kinnaur District of Himachal Pradesh as prescribed under the provisions of the Scheduled Tribes and Other Traditional Forest Dwellers (Recognition of Forest Rights) Act, 2006 as required under Condition 16 of the Forest Clearance dated 22.03.2011 issued by the Ministry of Environment and Forests;

- (ii) On the matter being referred to it, the Gram Sabha shall consider all community and individual claims which would bring within its ambit religious as well as cultural claims which would include impact on (a) places of worship likely to be affected by the construction works and activities cognate thereto; (b) Silt load in Kerang Stream caused by the diversion of water from the Kerang stream to Kashang stream and (c) the livelihood of the villagers caused by loss of forest land, landslides and possible loss of water sources due to the project.
- (iii) The Gram Sabha shall take up with the project proponent mitigation measures to offset the adverse impact of the project.
- (iv) While conducting the proceedings, the Gram Sabha shall, so far as it is possible, follow the process, guidelines and the procedure prescribed by the Ministry of Environment and Forests in its various letters from time to time.

# Kashang hydro project: NGT order gives respite to tribals





									-
		WORLD	BUSINESS	LIFE	ENTERTAINMENT	TECH	AUTO	PHOTOS	\
	I.WCENCHU								
0	chrome	vitch to Google Chrome for petter browsing experience				Downloa	d Now		

You are here: Latest News > India News

### In a first, Himachal villagers get a say in hydel power projects

#### Debobrat Ghose May 8, 2016 10:39 IST

#ConnectTheDots #Forest Rights Act #FRA #Gram Sabha #Himachal Pradesh #Hydel Projects #Kinnaur #Lippa #Ministry of Environment and Forest #MoEF #National Green Tribunal #NGT #Spiti Valley





It's a big victory for some 1,200 people of Lippa village in Kinnaur district in . After a seven-year struggle, the villagers have become the first grass-root people in the hill state to get empowered under *Gram Sabha* (village body of locals) to decide whether a hydel power project would be set up in their area or not.

The empowerment came when the rights of the villagers under the Forest Rights Act (FRA) were recognized following a judgment of National Green Tribunal (NGT) on 4 May.



Home » Politics

Last Modified: Sun, Sep 04 2016. 09 36 PM IST

#### Himachal Pradesh govt moves SC against NGT order on Kashang hydro project

The National Green Tribunal stopped the 130 megawatt Kashang hydropower project in Himachal Pradesh until gram sabhas of 19 villages cleared it





The Supreme Court in 2013 had ruled that 12 gram sabhas would decide whether to allow Vedanta Ltd's bauxite mining proposal in Odisha's Niyamgiri hills which is inhabited by tribals. Photo: Mint



Home > Himachal + J&K > Himachal withdraws appeal against NGT judgment on Rahul Gandhi's intervention

# Himachal withdraws appeal against NGT judgment on Rahul Gandhi's intervention

③ Sep 19, 2016 16:42:31





The Himachal Pradesh government has withdrawn its appeal against the recent judgment of the National Green Tribunal (NGT) filed in the apex court. Reaching out on telephone, Coordinator Himalaya Niti Abhiyan Guman Singh told Daily Post that on the intervention of AICC vice president

### Empowered Villages Are Causing Headaches for India's Modi

by Bibhudatta Pradhan ♥ bibhu\_pradhan

October 10, 2016 - 1:31 AM IST



Narendra Modi, Photographer: Dhiraj Singh/Bloomberg

Companies struggle to acquire land as villagers assert rights

"There will be more conflict," says environmental lawyer

#### **Hands tied**

The empowerment of villages by the National Green Tribunal is causing further BREAKING NEWS India ready with spin trap for England • Inspiring! How a water tank driver became Mr Asia 2016 • Ex-jawan's death over OROF sh las

#### Empowered villagers challenge Modi's easing of doing business

(14:15, 10 Oct 2016 Share this article
(f)
(t)
(g+)
(p)
(ln)



While Narendra Modi is promoting the ease of doing business in India, he is restrained from overhauling the Forest Rights Act to free up more land for companies



#### Report HIGH LEVEL COMMITTEE to review various Acts administered

by

Ministry of Environment, Forest & Climate Change, Government of India November 2014

## High Level Committee to Review Environmental Laws

Public Hearing/ consultation not required for:

- Projects of National Importance
- Projects of Strategic Importance
- Projects in Manufacturing/ Industrial Zone
- Projects in areas of high Pollution zone
- Projects located in areas which are away from settlement (Pristine areas)
- Projects related to power, coal, transmission lines, Highways etc

## Parliament Panel Rejects Report Seeking to Streamline Green Laws

All India | Written by Sidharth Pandey | Updated: July 26, 2015 20:14 IST





#### THREEQ UARTERS OF ENVIRONMENT SUPPLEMENT PLAN IS CUT-PASTE OF US DO CUMENT Environment Ministry's rules for polluters in India, copied word for word from the US

#### JAY MAZOOMDAAR NEWDELH JULY 7

MORE THAN three quarters of the Environment Ministry's Revisorment Supplement Plan [ESP] - around 2,900 words of the 3,850-word draft -- is adrat lift Bornthe Supplemental Reviverment A Projects Pokcy (SEP) documenta deptod by the UnitedStates in March 2015.

The draft notification proposes to allow those who go ast prior invironmental disarander Under Environment Impact AssessmentNotification (IIA), 2005 to "remediate the

Centre and

Mumbai to

probe Zakir

speeches

Naik's funds,

EXPRESS NEWS SERVICE.

NEWDELHE MUMBAL JULY T

ERMING Billippentars of 2014r

Nede, proacher and founder of

Marshei-besed Id areic Research

Resardation, as "object orable",

Union Information and

Broadcasting Minister M.

Venkaiah Nakhi said on

Thursday,

initiated at

leat one of the

#Berf75 concile

Mustryofficene Affairs.

Alan

ZektrNak

Under existing lave, these are criminal offences punishable withingeissensee The Ministrynshilled and put up the draft on its website on May10, nying public levelback over at your recents virialized Consider these substantive

more caused' and our

whethy implement on the ESD

sample softhe cut-paste that became the notification: US (introduction A): Suplo-

mental Environmental Project (SP)is an onvicormentally/senalso ad with project workswith-elidal project or activity that is not required by Law, but that a defendant agrees to undertake as part of the settlement of an enforment action.

	CONTRACTOR OF THE
P. C. P. P.	Sector Actor
Contraction Income on	and the second
Contraction of the second	A MARY AND

High lighted portio to have been copied from the US document

India (Classe 1): Au Environmental Supplemental Plan (1517) in american concrete the brackid projector ativitythat is not required by Low, but that as alleged violator of Environmental Impact Assessment Notification, 2005 agreentoursdertake aspart of the process of environmental degrance US(IIID) SIN provide defen-

dantow ithanopportunity to develop and demonstrate new technologies that may prove chestmanh with the second and the environment than existing processes and proorderse. India (4 iii)': Innovative

Technology: Environmental CONTINUE DON PAGE 2

The PM in Maguto, Measurabique Thurs day (7) PNCE 7

### Farm poll signal: Govt to take back dead land Bill

#### ANANOMISHRA FWDELH JULYT

THE GOVIESSMENT is conferenplating withdrawal of The Flight to fair Compensation and Transparency in Land Acquisition, Rehabilitation and Resttlement (Amendment) Bill 2015 during the monsoon session of Padiamentstaring July II.

The move comes at a time when the BP is braing for the Assemblypolic metyoartel/## Pradeuls, alargely agrad as state. Ahead of the lither amorphy elections last year, the government decided not to i mae the Land ordinance for the loar & time, hoping to blant Opposition attacks on its "artifarmer" Land Bill.

Sources and the latter of withdrawing the Billwar dis-THE NATIONAL Investigation cumed briefly at the june 29 meeting of the Cabinet

READING THE RESHUFFLE

Singly sources said, you of the wew that on a ning the 2015 Bit wasn o longer required sino states had been as led to com up with their own versions o landacquisit on Laws and man had alreadydoraethat.

Naisha, who was the the Patazertary Athia Misiste agneed buts aid the withdrawa could take place after the parks mentarypand exerting the it machanical discourses.

The XD-morehor joint com mittee on the land fill, source CONTINUED ON PAGE

Before reshuffle, an hard government sarces office screened all

Committee on Baliamentar Affairs during which a senio relationer said it was tirne to with the state of the light of the light Parliamentary Committee as amining the instae had decides with consersa a torestore moprovisions of the earlier lands: qualition Act. Horne Miraster Reput

Sources said M Werksial

Bengal to look for Bangla terrorists PRAVEEN SWAMI NEW DELHL JULY T

Centre asks

Assam and

Agency (NIA) has asked the West Bergal and Assam spyerranents to urgently step up the bastforfive log jama's -u-Mu da devellang alestatoreists known to be openiting from bases inside India highlyplaced government sources



JULY7

terrorista kovd-SDC DWS after the terminit atand in last tack at the upscale Guishan Rida's Dhaka ruckson in like of a dee husting



Stray bullet kills

Hindu woman,

two policemen

among 4 killed

neighbourhood in Dhala, terror ATV grab of the injured after ab last in Nishneeganj, Bangladesh, on Thursday Roave.





THIS ISN'T ISLAM, SAYS SHEIKH HASINA



News » India News

# Tigers crucial, but development more important, says Supreme Court

Last Updated: Thursday, January 21, 2016 - 09:32



# Key Challenges for public participation

- Public participation in the era of '*Ease of Doing Business*'
- Trying to replicate models of growth followed by other countries in a democratic set up.
- Consultation, participation and Consent
- The general feeling that there is *too much of democracy.*
- Public Participation takes place too late in the decision making process. (Investments made, land acquired)
- The Supreme Court's obsession with 'economic development' at all cost.

### Prafullla Samantra: Posco and Vedanta



Kumti Majjhi: Vedanta

### Lama Lobsang Gyato, Nyamjanchu Dam

Ramesh Aggarwal:

**Jindal Coal Mine**